



INTERREG IVB

Martin Doherty/Sarah Jayne Smith
Belfast City Council
4- 10 Linenhall Street Belfast
BT2 8BP
Belfast
UNITED KINGDOM

Lille, 16 December 2009

Concerns: 140E Sustainable Carbon Card for Community Enabling Schemes
(SUCCESS)

Outcome of the fifth IVB NWE Programme Steering Committee

(Conditionally approved)

Dear Martin Doherty, dear Sarah Jayne Smith,

On behalf of the Steering Committee, which met in Brussels on 8 and 9 December 2009, I am delighted to inform you that your project has been conditionally approved. Approval is subject to a series of conditions which follow in an attachment to this letter.

You are invited to immediately contact the officers following your project at the Secretariat, Anke Möllers (anke@nweurope.eu) and Thomas Leboulenger (thomas@nweurope.eu), to discuss how these conditions will be met.

The negotiation period to meet the conditions will last 2½ months due to the Christmas holidays and end by **26 February 2010** at the latest. You are reminded that failure to comply with this timetable could jeopardise the final approval of your project.



INTERREG IV B
Les Arcuriales, 6/D
45 rue de Tournai
F-59000 Lille, France

T. +33 3 20 78 55 00
F. +33 3 20 55 65 95
nwe@nweurope.eu
www.nweurope.eu



INTERREG IVB

The negotiation period follows three steps, as described below:

Step 1 by 29 January 2010 or earlier if convenient: *submission of a draft revised Application Form and an explanatory note by the project's Lead Partner (sent to the Secretariat by email only).*

During this period, the Lead Partner is advised to arrange a meeting with the abovementioned Officers at the earliest convenience, should further clarification on the conditions be needed. The Lead Partner should submit a draft revised Application Form together with an explanatory note making clear how the conditions laid down by the Steering Committee will be met.

Step 2 by 26 February 2010 or earlier if convenient: *submission of the final revised Application Form by the Lead Partner.*

During this period, the Secretariat will assess the draft revised Application Form and, if necessary, will negotiate any further amendments to be made. Subsequently, the Lead Partner should submit the final revised Application Form to the Secretariat duly signed and stamped, both in paper and electronic version.

Step 3 by 5 March 2010 or earlier if convenient: *final decision on the outcome of the negotiations by the Secretariat*

During this period, the Secretariat will assess the final revised Application Form. The decision on the outcome of the negotiations will be forwarded to the Lead Partner.

It is important to note that the Application Form forms part of the Subsidy Contract. Therefore, any changes made during the negotiations should be clearly reflected in the Application Form itself. The assessment is carried out on the basis of the Application Form alone. In this context, any other correspondence to or from the Secretariat cannot be used in the assessment and has no legal value.

In the event of a positive conclusion to the negotiations, the Secretariat will issue three original copies of the Subsidy Contract, including three copies of the final revised Application Form. To validate the Subsidy Contract, the Lead Partner must return two copies of the signed version to the Secretariat within two weeks; one copy must be kept by the Lead Partner.



INTERREG IV B
Les Arcuriales, 6/D
45 rue de Tournai
F-59000 Lille, France

T. +33 3 20 78 55 00
F. +33 3 20 55 65 95
nwe@nweurope.eu
www.nweurope.eu



INTERREG IVB

If the project fails the negotiations and the set conditions are not fully met, then it cannot be approved.

It is in everybody's interest to clarify these issues quickly - the sooner all conditions are met, the sooner the Subsidy Contract can be issued.

Following the full approval of the project, the final signed Partnership Agreement needs to be submitted. Please note, however, that the latest date for submission must coincide with the submission of the first Payment Claim and Progress Report related to the implementation of your project.

Additionally, you should be aware that the first level controllers designated in your application form each need to receive a certificate from their country's approbation body before their control can be deemed valid (for decentralised systems). These approbation bodies will directly contact the project's partners located in their country in the coming weeks; partners will need to fill in and send back a form as soon as possible.

After final approval, you will be invited by the Secretariat to attend a Lead Partner Seminar in Lille, where all programme procedures will be explained. This is currently scheduled for 18 and 19 March 2010. We recommend that you schedule any partner meeting after this seminar rather than before, since useful information and documents to be circulated to the whole partnership will be provided then.

Congratulations on your project being conditionally approved!

Yours sincerely,

Ruut Louwers
Programme Director



INTERREG IV B
Les Arcuriales, 6/D
45 rue de Tournai
F-59000 Lille, France

T. +33 3 20 78 55 00
F. +33 3 20 55 65 95
nwe@nweurope.eu
www.nweurope.eu

Cc. Paula MacLachlan and Ian Hill, INTERREG IVB NWE, Contact Points for united Kingdom



INTERREG IVB

Conditions for approval

The main aim of the project is transnational and the objective to incorporate the concept of industrial ecology (the focus on the sustainable combination of environment, ecology & technology) presents an interest for the priorities of the programme.

Despite those strengths, a serie of deficiencies needs to be reworked. Therefore, the project is approved under the following conditions:

Condition 1

Comprehensive information is missing in the action plan (selection criteria, terminals, reward etc.). Therefore, provide more detailed descriptions of all actions, and possibly change actions 7, 8, 9 into investments and regroup actions 19, 20 and 21. Provide more details for marketing and communication activities, including the involvement of beneficiaries (businesses, citizens).

Condition 2

Explain how capitalisation on the previous Rotterdam LIFE Programme initiative will take place; and clarify why the feasibility stage in WP1 is therefore needed.

Condition 3

The ownership of the Project by the Partners should be made clear, i.e. it should be ensured that the process is not driven by external parties.

Condition 4

Clarify the nature of the sub-partners and the role of the proposed observers, as well as the involvement of business associations, chambers of commerce, SMEs groups and Green NGOs so as to clarify their engagement for follow up activities of the project.

Condition 5

The project's ambition is to pilot the carbon card scheme and make it viable after the end of funding. A follow-up plan needs to be included to ensure the scheme is



INTERREG IV B
Les Arcunales, 6/D
45 rue de Tournai
F-59000 Lille, France

T. +33 3 20 78 55 00
F. +33 3 20 55 65 95
nwe@nweurope.eu
www.nweurope.eu



INTERREG IVB

sustainable after the project ends, and to ensure a good 'leverage effect', e.g. transferability to other NWE cities and commitment of the Partner regions.

Condition 6

Ensure that the management team is not only limited to an 'interim Manager'. Provide more details on the financial management structure, i.e. provide reference to the reporting milestones and describe in more details the audit trail with devise of responsibilities between the Lead Partner and the other partners.

Condition 7

The foreseen outputs of 50,000 cards and 100-200 businesses throughout the 4 Partners present a limited impact compared to the size of the Partner cities and the overall requested budget. The project, especially its experts and equipment costs can therefore be considered expensive. Consequently, provide further details on breakdown of costs to demonstrate the value for money, or reduce costs accordingly. The amount dedicated to the 1st Work Package (€588,988), notably the feasibility studies, should be justified. The different budget elements need to be presented as based on real costs instead of lump sums. Some foreseen costs are considered specifically expensive (or not detailed enough), notably for costs related to travel & accommodation (with some units amounting from €1,400 to €2,600), publicity costs (units of €12,500 and €50,000), equipment costs (unit related to microchip of €25,000). In general, the budget dedicated to Meetings & Seminars and Audit is limited, with notably no audit costs foreseen by Partners 1 and 3. Some equipment costs should be transferred to the Investment budget line (technical systems, smart cards, terminals, hosting and licensing) and the Publicity budget line (website).

Recommendations

Recommendation 1

Invite the City of Rotterdam to be an observer or 'expert advisor'.

Recommendation 2

Explore the possibility of including a Luxembourgish partner or observer.



INTERREG IV B
Les Arcuriales, 6/D
45 rue de Tournai
F-59000 Lille, France

T. +33 3 20 78 55 00
F. +33 3 20 55 65 95
nwe@nweurope.eu
www.nweurope.eu